

CLOSED

**U.S. District Court  
District of Maryland (Greenbelt)  
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 8:16-cv-03032-PX**

Ayyad et al v. Internal Revenue Service of the United States of America

Assigned to: Judge Paula Xinis

Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 08/31/2016

Date Terminated: 12/21/2018

Jury Demand: None

Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of Information Act

Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

**Plaintiff**

**Abdelrahman Ayyad**

represented by **Daniel Scott Heller**  
Kelly Dorsey, P.C.  
10320 Little Patuxent Parkway  
Suite 608  
Columbia, MD 21044  
410-740-8750  
Fax: 443-542-0069  
Email: [dheller@kellydorseylaw.com](mailto:dheller@kellydorseylaw.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Gerald Warren Kelly , Jr**  
Kelly | Dorsey, P.C.  
10320 Little Patuxent Parkway  
Suite 608  
Columbia, MD 21044  
410-740-8750  
Fax: 443-542-0069  
Email: [gerald.kelly@gwkesq.com](mailto:gerald.kelly@gwkesq.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Vadim David Ronzhes**  
Kelly Dorsey, P.C.  
10320 Little Patuxent Parkway  
Suite 608  
Columbia, MD 21044  
410-740-8750  
Fax: 443-542-0069  
Email: [vronzhes@kellydorseylaw.com](mailto:vronzhes@kellydorseylaw.com)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Plaintiff**

**Sara Ayyad**

represented by **Daniel Scott Heller**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Gerald Warren Kelly , Jr**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

**Vadim David Ronzhes**  
(See above for address)  
**LEAD ATTORNEY**  
**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

V.

**Defendant****Internal Revenue Service**represented by **Joycelyn S Peyton**

US Dept of Justice Tax Division

PO Box 227

Washington, DC 20044

2025146576

Fax: 2025146866

Email: [Joycelyn.S.Peyton@usdoj.gov](mailto:Joycelyn.S.Peyton@usdoj.gov)**LEAD ATTORNEY****ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED****Beatriz Teresa Saiz**

United States Department of Justice

Tax Division

P.O. Box 227

Washington, DC 20044

2023076585

Fax: 2025146866

Email: [beatriz.t.saiz@usdoj.gov](mailto:beatriz.t.saiz@usdoj.gov)**ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED**

Date Filed	#	Docket Text
08/31/2016	<u>1</u>	COMPLAINT against Internal Revenue Service of the United States of America ( Filing fee \$ 400 receipt number 0416-6213255.), filed by Internal Revenue Service of the United States of America. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Civil Cover Sheet Civil Cover Sheet, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Exhibits A – G)(Kelly, Gerald) (Entered: 08/31/2016)
08/31/2016	<u>2</u>	NOTICE by Internal Revenue Service of the United States of America re <u>1</u> Complaint, (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Summons, # <u>2</u> Summons)(Kelly, Gerald) (Entered: 08/31/2016)
08/31/2016		Case reassigned to Judge Paula Xinis. Judge Marvin J. Garbis no longer assigned to the case. (cags, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 08/31/2016)
09/01/2016	<u>3</u>	Summons Issued 21 days as to Internal Revenue Service. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 09/01/2016)
10/06/2016	<u>4</u>	SUMMONS Returned Executed by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad. Internal Revenue Service served on 10/4/2016, answer due 12/5/2016. (Kelly, Gerald) (Entered: 10/06/2016)
11/04/2016	<u>5</u>	Consent MOTION for Extension of Time by Internal Revenue Service (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 11/04/2016)
11/08/2016	<u>6</u>	PAPERLESS ORDER GRANTING <u>5</u> Motion for Extension of Time. Defendant's Answer or otherwise Response to the Complaint is due by December 6, 2016. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 11/8/2016. (tb2s, Chambers) (Entered: 11/08/2016)
12/06/2016	<u>7</u>	ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint, by Internal Revenue Service.(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 12/06/2016)
12/07/2016	<u>8</u>	SCHEDULING ORDER: Status Report due by 4/20/2017. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 12/7/2016. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 12/08/2016)
12/07/2016	<u>9</u>	LETTER ORDER re The Filing of Motions. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 12/7/2016. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 12/08/2016)
12/16/2016	<u>10</u>	STATUS REPORT by Internal Revenue Service(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 12/16/2016)
12/20/2016		Telephone Conference held on 12/20/2016 before Judge Paula Xinis. (tb2s, Chambers) (Entered: 12/20/2016)

12/20/2016	<u>11</u>	PAPERLESS ORDER: For the reasons discussed during today's status conference and in light of the nature of this case, the Court suspends the scheduling order issued at ECF No. 10. Dispositive Motions are due March 13, 2017. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 12/20/16. (tb2s, Chambers) (Entered: 12/20/2016)
03/10/2017	<u>12</u>	Correspondence re: Dispositive Motion (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(Ronzhes, Vadim) (Entered: 03/10/2017)
03/13/2017	<u>13</u>	LETTER ORDER scheduling a conference call for March 20, 2017 at 11:00 a.m. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 3/13/2017. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 03/13/2017)
03/13/2017	<u>14</u>	PAPERLESS NOTICE: The conference call scheduled for March 20, 2017 is CANCELLED. (tb2s, Chambers) (Entered: 03/13/2017)
03/13/2017	<u>15</u>	MOTION for Extension of Time <i>for Dispositive Motions</i> by Internal Revenue Service (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 03/13/2017)
03/15/2017	<u>16</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>15</u> MOTION for Extension of Time <i>for Dispositive Motions</i> filed by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Kelly, Gerald) (Entered: 03/15/2017)
03/15/2017	<u>17</u>	(FILED IN ERROR – PER COUNSEL) MOTION for Summary Judgment by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memo of Pts and Auth, # <u>2</u> Affidavit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>5</u> Certificate of Service)(Ronzhes, Vadim) Modified on 3/17/2017 (jf3s, Deputy Clerk). (Entered: 03/15/2017)
03/17/2017	<u>18</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum of Points and Authorities, # <u>2</u> Affidavit, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>4</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>5</u> Certificate of Service)(Ronzhes, Vadim) (Entered: 03/17/2017)
03/20/2017	<u>19</u>	PAPERLESS ORDER GRANTING <u>15</u> Motion for Extension of Time. Dispositive Motions shall be filed no later than April 12, 2017. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 3/20/2017. (tb2s, Chambers) (Entered: 03/20/2017)
04/12/2017	<u>20</u>	MOTION to Stay <i>Further Summary Judgment Briefing and to Modify Briefing Schedule</i> by Internal Revenue Service (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 04/12/2017)
04/17/2017	<u>21</u>	Corrected MOTION to Stay re <u>20</u> MOTION to Stay <i>Further Summary Judgment Briefing and to Modify Briefing Schedule</i> by Internal Revenue Service (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 04/17/2017)
04/19/2017	<u>22</u>	Letter Order scheduling a conference call for April 25, 2017 at 2:00 p.m. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 4/19/2017. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 04/19/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>23</u>	Telephone Conference held on 4/25/2017 before Judge Paula Xinis.(FTR – Ulander – 4C.) (bus, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
04/25/2017	<u>24</u>	ORDER granting in part <u>21</u> Motion to Continue; setting Amended Scheduling Order. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 4/25/2017. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 04/25/2017)
05/31/2017	<u>25</u>	MOTION for Summary Judgment by Internal Revenue Service (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum in Support of Cross Motion for Summary Judgment, # <u>2</u> Declaration of K. Feldman, # <u>3</u> Declaration of M. Cottrell, # <u>4</u> Declaration of J. Perez, # <u>5</u> Declaration of W. Rowe, # <u>6</u> Exhibit A, # <u>7</u> Exhibit B, # <u>8</u> Exhibit C, # <u>9</u> Exhibit D, # <u>10</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 05/31/2017)
06/16/2017	<u>26</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>25</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Memorandum of Points and Authorities, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order, # <u>3</u> Certificate of Service)(Kelly, Gerald) (Entered: 06/16/2017)
07/03/2017	<u>27</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>25</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Internal Revenue Service.(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 07/03/2017)
07/12/2017	<u>28</u>	Supplemental to <u>25</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Internal Revenue Service (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Supplement W. Rowe Declaration)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 07/12/2017)

08/18/2017	<u>29</u>	Correspondence re: Discovery Motion (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service)(Heller, Daniel) (Entered: 08/18/2017)
08/18/2017	<u>30</u>	Correspondence re: Plaintiffs' Discovery Motion (Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 08/18/2017)
08/22/2017	<u>31</u>	ORDER scheduling a conference call for September 1, 2017 at 10:30 a.m. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 8/22/2017. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 08/22/2017)
09/01/2017	<u>32</u>	NOTICE of Appearance by Beatriz Teresa Saiz on behalf of Internal Revenue Service (Saiz, Beatriz) (Entered: 09/01/2017)
09/01/2017	<u>33</u>	PAPERLESS ORDER: For the reasons stated during today's telephone conference, the parties are to submit letter pleadings of no more than 5 pages, exclusive of exhibits, with exhibits filed under seal, pursuant to the following schedule: Plaintiff's motion is due by 9/15/2017, the government's reply is due by 9/29/2017, and Plaintiff's reply is due by 10/6/2017. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 9/1/2017. (sat, Chambers) (Entered: 09/01/2017)
09/01/2017	<u>34</u>	Telephone Conference held on 9/1/2017 before Judge Paula Xinis.(FTR Station.) (bus, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 09/01/2017)
09/15/2017	<u>35</u>	–SEALED– MOTION for Discovery <i>Determination Pursuant to FRCP 26(b)(5)(B)</i> by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Certificate of Service, # <u>5</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Heller, Daniel) (Entered: 09/15/2017)
09/19/2017	<u>36</u>	QC NOTICE: A certificate of service indicating how service was made for <u>35</u> Motion for Discovery, filed by Abdelrahman Ayyad and Sara Ayyad, has not been filed – Sealed documents are not accessible through ECF, Please provide the Government with a service copy of the sealed documents filed then file the Certificate of Service. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 09/19/2017)
09/19/2017	<u>37</u>	CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad re <u>35</u> MOTION for Discovery <i>Determination Pursuant to FRCP 26(b)(5)(B)</i> (Heller, Daniel) (Entered: 09/19/2017)
09/29/2017	<u>38</u>	RESPONSE in Opposition re <u>35</u> MOTION for Discovery <i>Determination Pursuant to FRCP 26(b)(5)(B)</i> filed by Internal Revenue Service. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit of J. Peyton, # <u>2</u> Exhibit A, # <u>3</u> Exhibit B, # <u>4</u> Exhibit C, # <u>5</u> Exhibit D, # <u>6</u> Exhibit E, # <u>7</u> Exhibit F, # <u>8</u> Exhibit G, # <u>9</u> Exhibit H, # <u>10</u> Exhibit I, # <u>11</u> Exhibit J, # <u>12</u> Exhibit K, # <u>13</u> Exhibit L, # <u>14</u> Exhibit M)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 09/29/2017)
09/29/2017	<u>39</u>	–SEALED – NOTICE of Filing Under Seal Declaration of J. Peyton with Exhibits by Internal Revenue Service re <u>38</u> Response in Opposition to Motion, (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H, # <u>9</u> Exhibit I, # <u>10</u> Exhibit J, # <u>11</u> Exhibit K, # <u>12</u> Exhibit L, # <u>13</u> Exhibit M)(Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 09/29/2017)
10/06/2017	<u>40</u>	–SEALED–REPLY to Response to Motion re <u>35</u> MOTION for Discovery <i>Determination Pursuant to FRCP 26(b)(5)(B)</i> filed by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Certificate of Service, # <u>2</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Heller, Daniel) (Entered: 10/06/2017)
01/18/2018	<u>41</u>	NOTICE of Hearing: Motion Hearing set for 2/1/2018 at 03:00 PM in Courtroom 4C, 6500 Cherrywood Lane, Greenbelt, Maryland 20770, before Judge Paula Xinis. (tb2s, Chambers) (Entered: 01/18/2018)
02/01/2018	<u>42</u>	Motion Hearing held on 2/1/2018 re <u>25</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Internal Revenue Service, <u>18</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment filed by Abdelrahman Ayyad, Sara Ayyad before Judge Paula Xinis.(Court Reporter: Marlene Kerr – 4C) (bus, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 02/01/2018)
02/02/2018	<u>43</u>	MEMORANDUM OPINION. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 2/2/2018. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 02/05/2018)
02/02/2018	<u>44</u>	ORDER granting in part and denying in part <u>18</u> Plaintiff's Motion for Summary Judgment; granting in part and denying in part <u>25</u> Defendant's Motion for Summary Judgment; denying as moot <u>35</u> Motion for Discovery Determination. Signed by Judge

		Paula Xinis on 2/2/2018. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 02/05/2018)
03/07/2018	<u>45</u>	NOTICE by Internal Revenue Service re <u>44</u> Order on Motion for Summary Judgment,,, Order on Motion for Discovery, (Peyton, Joycelyn) (Entered: 03/07/2018)
09/24/2018	<u>46</u>	LETTER ORDER directing the IRS to release redacted documents to the Plaintiff no later than December 1, 2018. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 9/24/2018. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 09/24/2018)
11/30/2018	<u>47</u>	NOTICE by Internal Revenue Service re <u>46</u> Order of Compliance (Saiz, Beatriz) (Entered: 11/30/2018)
12/21/2018	<u>48</u>	LETTER ORDER memorializing the Court's Ruling and shall become the final ruling in <u>46</u> Letter Order; directing the Clerk to close this case. Signed by Judge Paula Xinis on 12/21/2018. (jf3s, Deputy Clerk) (Entered: 12/21/2018)